THE AGRARIAN QUESTION
AND REFORMISM IN
LATIN AMERICA

Alain de Janvry

The Johns Hopkins University Press
Baltimore and London
Contents

Chapter 1. Laws of Motion in the Center-Periphery Structure: The Underlying Forces 7

Evolution of Thought on Unequal Development 9
The Dialectic Between Production and Circulation 23
Contradictions of Accumulation in Articulated Economies 26
Contradictions of Accumulation in Disarticulated Economies 32
Dependency, Class Structure, and Social Disarticulation 40
Market-Widening and Market-Deepening 45
Mechanisms of Surplus Transfer Between Center and Periphery 50
  Industrial and Financial Imperialism 50
  Surplus Transfer Through Trade 52
Unequal Exchange 53
Unequal Trade 54
Unequal Rewards in the Formation of International Prices 54
Accumulation in the Center-Periphery Structure and the Current Crisis 55

Chapter 2. Agrarian Crisis in Latin America: The Facts 61

Integration of Latin American Agriculture into the National and World Economies 61
Patterns of Growth and Stagnation 68  
The Rise and Logic of Functional Dualism 81  
The Contradictions of Functional Dualism 85

Chapter 3. Transformation of the Agrarian Structure and the Peasantry 94

The Nature and Future of the Peasantry 95  
The Marxist Classics 96  
Peasantry as a Specific Type of Economy 100  
An Alternative Conceptualization of Peasants 102  
Roads to the Development of Capitalism in Agriculture 106  
Modes of Production, Social Classes, and Types of Farm Enterprises 109  
A Typology of Farm Enterprises 109  
Empirical Characterization of the Rural Class Structure 114  
Dynamics of Class Differentiation 117  
Empirical Characterization of Class Differentiation: Global Data 118  
Empirical Characterization of Class Differentiation: Country Studies 123  
Mexico 123  
Colombia 131  
Peru 136

Chapter 4. Disarticulated Accumulation and Agrarian Crisis 141

Prevalent Theses on the Food and Hunger Crisis 141  
Neo-Malthusianism 142  
Technological Determinism 143  
Monetarist Thesis of Stagnation 144  
Structuralist Thesis of Stagnation 146  
Overconsumption: Austerity and Aid 148  
Poverty: Employment and Nutrition Programs 149  
Material Determinants of the Agrarian Crisis 151  
The Contradiction Between Rent and Profit in the Transition to Capitalism 152  
Cheap Food and Foreign Exchange: The Contradictions 157  
Food Self-Sufficiency Versus Comparative Advantages 158  
Cheap-Food Policies Versus Development of Capitalism in Agriculture 162  
Technological Bias Toward Laborsaving 169  
Use Versus Reproduction of the Peasantry as a Source of Cheap Food 172  
The Global Crisis 174
## The New World Order: A New International Division of Labor for Agriculture? 175

### Chapter 5. The Political Economy of Reformism 182
- The Capitalist State 183
- The Petty Bourgeoisie and Legitimation 187
- The Peripheral State 191
- Reforms and the Management of Crises 193
- The Limits of Reformism 195
  - Legitimacy Crisis of the State 196
  - Fiscal Crisis of the State 196
  - Administrative Crisis of the State 197
- Agrarian Reformism in Latin America 197

### Chapter 6. Types and Consequences of Land Reform 202
- A Typology of Land Reforms 203
  - Redistributive Reforms 207
    - Transition from Precapitalist Mode to Junker Road 208
    - Transition from Precapitalist Mode to Farmer Road 209
    - Shift from Junker Road to Farmer Road 209
    - Transition from Junker Road to Precapitalist Mode 210
    - Transition from Farmer Road to Precapitalist Mode 210
    - Shift from Farmer Road to Junker Road 210
- Consequences of Land Reforms 211
  - Observation I: Market Expansion 211
  - Observation II: Development of Capitalism in the Nonreform Sector 214
  - Observation III: Political Stabilization Through the Reform Sector 218
  - Observation IV: Functional Dualism 220
- The End of Land Reform 221

### Chapter 7. The Strategy of Integrated Rural Development 224
- A Typology of Rural-Development Projects 224
- Criteria for the Evaluation of Rural-Development Projects 231
- Puebla-Type Rural-Development Projects 234
  - The Puebla Project 234
  - The Garcia Rovira Project 235
  - The Cajamarca Project 237
- Economic Achievements of Rural-Development Projects 238
Structural Characteristics of the Peasant Economy That Condition Technological Change 239
  Functional Dualism 239
  Semiproletarianization 242
  Labor Scarcity 246
Profitability and Risk 247
  New Technologies for Peasant Agriculture 248
  Effective Demand 249
  Risk 250
Diffusion Strategy 250
  Extension Model 250
  Institutional Linkages 251
The Political Economy of Integrated Rural Development 252

Chapter 8. The Agrarian Question and Change in Latin America: Conclusions 255
Policy Proposals for Growth with Equity 255
  Employment Creation 256
  Integrated Rural Development 256
  Redistribution with Growth and Basic Needs 256
  New International Economic Order 257
  Redistribution Before Growth 257
The Limits of Reformism 259
The Political Economy of Equitable Growth 264

Notes 269
Selected Bibliography 303
Index 307

Figures
1.1. Structure of an Articulated Economy 27
1.2. Structure of Disarticulated Export-Enclave Economies 32
1.3. Structure of Disarticulated Import-Substitution Industrialization Economies 33
1.4. Productivity of Labor and Real Wages in Manufacturing, United States and Brazil, 1966-74 35
1.5. Social Class Structure and Alliances 42
Tables

1.1. Average Annual Growth Rates in Gross Domestic Product, Manufacturing, and Gross Fixed Capital Formation 19
1.2. Growth and Income Distribution, 1960–70 36
1.3. Share of Different Income Strata in Total Consumption, 1974, and Growth Rate of Production by Type of Commodity, 1967–68 to 1975–76 47
1.4. Mexico: Distribution of Income and Consumption in Urban Households, 1968 49
1.5. Flow of Funds Related to Direct U.S. Investment, 1960–72 51
2.1. Agricultural Production in Latin America, Selected Years 69
2.2. Rate of Growth of Production by Commodity and Country, 1948–52 to 1968–72 72
2.3. Real Price Tendencies (Rate of Change per Year), 1950–70 74
2.4. Share of Large Farms in Total Production, and Mean Area Harvested per Farm, 1950–71 75
2.5. Share of Production Sold and Share of Labor Hired, by Crop 77
2.7. Share of Selected Foods in the Urban Wage Basket, Selected Years and Countries 79
3.1. Rural Social Classes in Latin America: Distribution of Households and Land 115
3.2. Dynamics of Land Tenure Systems: Initial and Terminal Percentages 119
3.3. Size of Farms Less Than 5 Hectares in Area for Eleven Central and South American Countries, 1950–70 122
3.4. Mexico: Hectares of Land Benefited by Major Federal Irrigation Projects as a Percentage of Total Hectares Cultivated, 1940–60 125
3.6. Mexico: Distribution of Cultivated Area and Value Share of Production by Farm Size, 1940–70 127
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Mexico: Average Area per Landholding, 1960 and 1970</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>Mexico: Number of Farms, Percentage of Farms, and Total Land Area in the Private Sector Controlled by Farms, by Farm Size, 1940–70</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>Colombia: Value Share of Total Production by Type of Crop, 1950–55 and 1971–76</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>Colombia: Land Area Cultivated, by Type of Crop, 1950–55 and 1971–76</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Colombia: Land Distribution by Number and Size of Farm and by Total Area, 1960 and 1970</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>Peru: Distribution of Farms and Agricultural Land by Farm Size, 1960–70</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Price of Nitrogen Relative to That of Wheat and Corn at the Producer Level in Latin America and Elsewhere</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Wheat Yields and Relative Prices Received by Farmers, 1968–70</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Comparison of Annual Rates of Change in Selected Economic Indicators in the United States, 1950–68 and 1968–77</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Statistical Information on Land Reforms in Selected Latin American Countries, 1917–76</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Puebla: Profitability of Farm Activities by Farm Type, 1970</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Cajamarca, Puebla, and Garcia Rovira: Distribution of Farms by Farm Type, 1970–73</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Cajamarca, Puebla, and Garcia Rovira: Sources of Net Household Income by Farm Type</td>
<td>244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Cajamarca: Sources of Net Household Income by Farm Type, 1973</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>